

Needham, Chapter 2, Exercise 13, p. 114

G. Palmer, July 28, 2020, 2:40 pm PST

13. We have seen that if we set $P_n(z) = z^n$, then the representation of a complex function $f(z)$ as an infinite series $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} c_n P_n(z)$ (i.e., a power series) is unique. This is not true, however, if $P_n(z)$ is just any old set of polynomials. The following example is taken (and corrected) from Boas [1987, p. 33]. Defining

$$P_0(z) = -1, \text{ and } P_n(z) = \frac{z^{n-1}}{(n-1)!} - \frac{z^n}{n!} \quad (n = 1, 2, 3, \dots)$$

show that

$$-2P_0 - P_1 + P_3 + 2P_4 + 3P_5 + \dots = e^z = P_1 + 2P_2 + 3P_3 + 4P_4 + \dots$$

One must see that the LHS is an infinite series, which can be rewritten

$$\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} (j-2) P_j$$

The RHS can be rewritten

$$\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j$$

Therefore

$$\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} (j-2) P_j = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j$$

Expand the LHS

$$-\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} 2 P_j + \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} j P_j$$

$$2 - 2\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P_j + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j \quad (\text{because } P_0(z) = -1)$$

Calculate

$$\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P_j = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(\frac{z^{j-1}}{(j-1)!} - \frac{z^j}{j!} \right)$$

$$= \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^{j-1}}{(j-1)!} - \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^j}{j!}$$

$$= \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{z^k}{k!} - \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^j}{j!} \quad (\text{Change of index to } k \text{ does not change value of } \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^{j-1}}{(j-1)!}.)$$

$$= 1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^j}{j!} - \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^j}{j!} \quad (\text{Change } k \text{ back to } j.)$$

$$= 1 \quad (1)$$

Calculate

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j &= \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(\frac{j z^{j-1}}{(j-1)!} - \frac{j z^j}{j!} \right) \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(k+1) z^k}{k!} - \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{j z^j}{j!} \quad \text{(by setting } k = j-1 \text{ in first term on LHS; it does not change value of term)} \\ &= 1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(\frac{(j+1) z^j}{j!} - \frac{j z^j}{j!} \right) \quad \text{(changing } k \text{ to } j \text{ does not change value)} \\ &= 1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^j}{j!} = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{z^j}{j!} = e^z \quad (2), \text{ from p. 79) } \end{aligned}$$

From (1) and (2), the LHS becomes

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P_j &= 1 \\ \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j &= e^z \\ 2 - 2 \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} P_j + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j &= 2 - 2 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j \\ &= \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j = e^z \end{aligned}$$

Calculate the RHS.

$$P_1 + 2 P_2 + 3 P_3 + 4 P_4 + \dots = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} j P_j = e^z$$

$$\text{Then } -2 P_0 - P_1 + P_3 + 2 P_4 + 3 P_5 + \dots = e^z = P_1 + 2 P_2 + 3 P_3 + 4 P_4 + \dots$$

This is what we wanted. If we examine and compare coefficients on the two sides, we have

LHS						RHS					
C_0	C_1	C_2	C_3	C_4	...	C_0	C_1	C_2	C_3	C_4	
...	-2	-1	0	1	2	...	0	1	2	3	4
...											

Both sets of coefficients produce the function e^z in the infinite series. This shows that there is no unique set of coefficients for an infinite series based on the polynomial $P_n(z) = \frac{z^{n-1}}{(n-1)!} - \frac{z^n}{n!}$. Approximations based on the first few members of each power series will differ.